03 MDL 1570 (GBD) (SN)

IN RE: : ORDER

TERRORIST ATTACKS ON : SEPTEMBER 11, 2001 :

. X

This document relates to:

Burnett, et al. v. Islamic Rep. of Iran, et al., No. 15-cv-9903 (GBD)(SN) Prior, et al. v. Islamic Rep. of Iran, No. 19-cv-44 (GBD)(SN)

## ORDER GRANTING PARTIAL FINAL DEFAULT JUDGMENT FOR THE PLAINTIFFS LISTED IN EXHIBIT A

GEORGE B. DANIELS, United States District Judge:

The *Burnett* Plaintiffs listed in Exhibit A move for entry of partial final default judgment against Defendants the Islamic Republic of Iran, the Islamic Revolutionary Guard Corps, and the Central Bank of the Islamic Republic of Iran (collectively, "Defendants"). (ECF No. 9733. ) As non-United States nationals, these Plaintiffs cannot bring claims against Iran under 28 U.S.C. § 1605A(c) (*see* ECF No. 9666, at 1) and therefore ask this Court to hold Defendants liable under New York tort law. The Court adjudges Defendants liable to the Plaintiffs listed in Exhibit A under New York law for substantially the same reasons as stated in this Court's March 26, 2024 and June 17, 2024 Orders. (*See* ECF Nos. 9666, 9931.)

In addition to seeking damages under New York law, which the Court grants, Plaintiffs also seek default judgment as to liability for four "classifications" of Plaintiffs, as well as damages for non-United States nationals under Virginia law. (See ECF Nos. 9733, 9736-3.) These aspects

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Unless otherwise stated, all ECF citations included herein refer to documents filed on the 9/11 multidistrict litigation docket. *See In re Terrorist Attacks on Sept. 11, 2001*, No. 03-md-1570 (GBD) (SN).

of Plaintiffs' motion require the Court to take up new legal questions. In light of the approaching VSSTF deadline and the Court's desire to adjudicate as many economic damages requests as possible beforehand, the Court issues this order and reserves judgment as to the novel legal questions for a subsequent order.

Accordingly, upon consideration of the evidence and arguments set forth in the Declaration of John M. Eubanks, Esq. and the exhibits thereto (ECF No. 9735), together with the entire record in this case, it is hereby

ORDERED that service of process in the above-captioned cases was properly effectuated upon Defendants (ECF No. 64 in No. 15-cv-9903; ECF No. 18 in 19-cv-44); and it is

ORDERED that partial final judgment is entered on behalf of the Plaintiffs identified in Exhibit A against the Defendants<sup>2</sup>; and it is

ORDERED that the Plaintiffs identified in Exhibit A are awarded economic damages as set forth therein<sup>3</sup> and as supported by the expert reports and analyses tendered in conjunction with the Eubanks Declarations (ECF No. 9735); and it is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Plaintiffs seek treble damages. The Court has denied U.S. national Plaintiffs' requests for treble damages against the Islamic Republic of Iran because Anti-Terrorism Act ("ATA") claims cannot be brought against sovereign defendants. See 18 U.S.C. § 2337(2). Consistent with these prior decisions, see, e.g., ECF No. 10292, and to ensure consistency between awards for U.S. nationals and non-U.S. nationals, the Plaintiffs' motions are DENIED as to their requests for treble damages.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> This Court was unable to find the following parties in the citations provided by the *Burnett* Plaintiffs in their default judgment motion cover sheet. (ECF No. 9736-1.) Therefore, their motion is DENIED without prejudice as to the following parties' requests for partial final default judgment: Joy Bennett and Adrian Bennett as the personal representatives of the Estate of Oliver Duncan Bennett (whose Estate is not listed as a Plaintiff); Derek Edward Bristow as the personal representative of the Estate of Paul Gary Bristow (whose Estate is not listed as a Plaintiff); Abigail Jane Carter as the personal representative of the Estate of Caleb Arron Dack; David de Vere as the personal representative of the Estate of Melanie Louise De Vere; Raymond Duger as the personal representative of the Estate of Antoinette Duger; Ellen Ruth Judd as the personal representative of the Estate of Christine Egan; Timothy John and Glyn John as the personal representatives of the Estate of Nicholas John (whose Estate is not listed as a Plaintiff); Angela Rogers and Keith Rogers as the personal representatives of the Estate of Karlie Barbara Rogers. The claim of Barbara E. DaMota, as Personal Representative of the Estate of Manuel John DaMota, has also been removed, pursuant to ECF No. 10039.

**ORDERED** that the Plaintiffs identified in Exhibit A are awarded compensatory damages for decedents' pain and suffering in an amount of \$2,000,000.00 per estate, as set forth therein; and it is

**ORDERED** that the Plaintiffs receiving economic damages identified in Exhibit A are awarded prejudgment interest of 4.96 percent per annum, compounded annually, running from the date indicated in the "Date of Report" column therein<sup>4</sup>; and it is

**ORDERED** that the Plaintiffs receiving pain and suffering damages identified in Exhibit A are awarded prejudgment interest of 4.96 percent per annum, compounded annually, running from September 11, 2001, until the date of judgment; and it is

**ORDERED** that the Plaintiffs identified in the attached Exhibit A may submit future applications for punitive or other damages at a later date consistent with any future rulings of this Court; and it is

**ORDERED** that the Plaintiffs not appearing on Exhibit A may submit in later stages applications for damages awards to the extent they have not done so already.

The Clerk of Court is directed to enter partial final default judgment for the Plaintiffs listed in Exhibit A.

Dated: September 19, 2024 New York, New York

SO ORDERED.

ABORGH B. DANIELS United States District Judge

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The Court adjusted the date listed for the Estate of Jayceryll Malabuyoc de Chavez to reflect the date listed in the expert report at ECF No. 9735-4, at 78.

## Exhibit A

Piaintiff, as Personal Representative of the Estate of 9/11 Decedant	esentative of the Es	tate of 9/11 Decedent			õ	9/11 Decedent			Claim Information		_	Pain & Suffering Damages		Берпея	Economic Damages	
First	Middle	Last Suffix		First Middle	nsel	Suffix Nationality on 9/11	Date of 9/11 She	5	Complaint	Amendments &	Prior	Amount	Report Date of	Prior	Amount	Treble
	Celeste Aryee		Japhet		Arvee	Ghana	9/11/01[NY (WFC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 3170			\$ 2,000,000,00	1/29/2024		\$ 6.523.355.00	
Katherine	Agnes Balley		Garnet		Ballcy	Canada	9/11/01 NY (UA175)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 2314			\$ 2 000 000.00	1/10/2020		\$ 5416 710 00	
Maureen Ely	Elzabeth Basnicki		Kennett	melliwi n	Basnicki	Canada	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 \$3 at 3563			\$ 2,000,000,00	2/15/2024		S TO 941 249 00	
	Beatty		Jane		Beatty	United Kingdom	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	150-9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 3506			\$ 2,000,000,00	1/29/2024		\$ 6320.477.00	
S Matcolm Ph	Phillip Campbel	-	Geoffre	ey Thomas	Campbell	United Kingdom	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 3157			\$ 2,000,000,00	2/8/2024		5 16 441 891.00	
×	Alexandra Clarke		Surla	12 12 13 14 14 15 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16	Clarke	United Kingdom	9/11/01 NY (WITC)	15049903	11:15-cv-09903 53 at 3591		ľ	\$ 2000,000.00				
Donald J.	Peissant		Cynthla	Marie	Connolly	Canada	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09909 53 at 2755			\$ 2,000,000,00	1/10/2020		5 9 212 611.00	
Nigel Du	Durnstan Cox		Andre		Cox	St. Vincent and the	NY (WTC)		1:15-cv-09903 53 at 3087							-
Ι				T	П	Grenading	9/11/01	150-9903		1,12,11	100	\$ 2000,000,000	2/20/2024	,,,	\$ 9 308 134,00	
Asuncton		de Chavez de Chavez	Jaycentl	Al Malabuyoc	T	Philippines	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 1 53 at 366 4778 at 3	1000		\$ 2 000 000.00	2/29/2024	100	\$ 12 461 980.00	
***************************************	Ţ		Richard	A	Dunstan	England	9/11/01 NY [WTC]	15549903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 1154	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1		\$ 2000,000,00	1000			
	Maria Egan		Michael		Egan	Canada	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 579			\$ 2,000,000,00			<u></u>	
	Escarcora	13	Sarah	Aľ		United Kingdom	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	1509903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 3605			\$ 2000,000,00	4/4/2024		\$ 13 103 471.00	
13 Jennifer Rene	he Ewart		Meredith	ith Em ly June	Ewart	Canada	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15049903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 88	11.11.11.11		\$ 2,000,000,00	7.55			
14 Tessie	Molina		Christopher	pher Hugh	Forsythe	United Kingdom	9/11/01 NY [WTC]	150/9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 439			\$ 2000,000,00				
15 Hans	Gerhardt		Relph		Gerhardt	Canada	9/11/01 NY [WTC]	150/9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 3501	1000		\$ 2000 000.00	1/10/2020		\$ 18 122 886.00	
15 Deena Joan	n Gilbey		Paul	Stuart	Gilbey	United Kingdom	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	1Scv9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 1416			\$ 2000,000,00	1/10/2020		\$ 12 215 596.00	
17 Victoria	Blaksley		Pedro		Grehan	Argentina	9/11/01 NY [WTC]	15<<9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 1727	The second second		\$ 2,000,000,00	-:			
18 Boverly	H2H		Vaswald	d George	Hall	Jamaka	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 3598	77 10 10 10		\$ 2000,000,00				
19 Susan	Jones		Christopher	pher D.	Jones	United Kingdom	9/11/D1 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-0-0903 53 at 2883			\$ 2,000,000,00	1/13/2020		5 14 785 800.00	
20 Salamon	Gayle		Sellaí		Khoo	Malaysia	9/11/01 NY [WTC]	15049903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 400			\$ 2000 000,00	1/13/2020		5 73 639 140,00	
21 Sonta	Gawas		Ganesh		Ladkat	India	9/11/01 NY [WTC]	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 1541			\$ 2,000,000,000				
Se	Ì		Wel Rong	But	ul.	Chlna	9/11/01[NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 2554			\$ 2,000,000,00	1/10/2020		\$ 12 114 565.00	
	П		Jerame		Lohez	France	9/11/01[NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 3509			\$ 2,000,000,000				
24 Maureen M	Marguerite Maddison		Simon		Maddlson	United Kingdom	9/11/01[NY (WTC)	15<49903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 1349			5 2 000 000.00				
25 Willam	Ţ		Christine	1	McNulty	United Kingdom	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 3584	54 (20 to 20		\$ 2,000,000.00				
25 Myrtie	Bazi		Shevenne	ne Olicia	Mentis	Guyana	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 2050	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1		\$ 2,000,000,00	1/14/2020		\$ 8 917 674.00	
27 Keolahmatle	Nath		Narender	ler	Nath	India	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 2533	The Addition of		\$ 2,000,000.00				
28 Lachman	Parbhu		Hardaí		Parbhu	Guyana	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 3537	1000		\$ 2 000 000.00				
29 Yogesh R.	Patel		Avnish	Ramanbhal	Patel	United Kingdom	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cx-09903 53 at 78			5 2 000 000:00				
30 Silverla	Segura		Juan	છ	Salas	Dominican Republic	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 4778 at 6			\$ 2 000 000.00	1/13/2020		5 6631265.00	
31 Lucy E.	Thompson	on	Clive		Thompson	United Kingdom	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	1509903	1:15-cv-09903 S3 at 1324			5 2 000 000.00				
32 Sharon B.	Schultz		Karama	,	Trerra	Gambia	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 1561	7 1 2 2 2 2		\$ 2 000 000.00				
	Rachel Tumer		Simon	James	Turner	United Kingdom	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1115-cv-09903 53 at 3556			\$ 2,000,000,00				
34 Yun-Ju	Wen		Szv-Hu	_	Won	Tahean	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cx-09903 53 at 1191	100		\$ 2,000,000.00				
35 Victor M.			Signid		Wiswe	Germany	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	19cv44	1:19-cv-00044 1 Appx. Pg. 12			\$ 2,000,000.00	A.			
	1		Martin	Michael	Wortley	United Kingdom	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	1509903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 2258			\$ 2 000 000.00 j				
	McCardle Yambem	_	Jupiter		Yamberi	India	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15cv9903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 3284		-	\$ 2,000,000,00	1/13/2020		5 7 936 398.00	
38 Altha	Vemulapalii	mar.	Surgh		Yanamadala	india	9/11/01 NY (WTC)	15049903	1:15-cv-09903 53 at 3543			\$ 2,000,000,00				